arXiv:1207.5498v1 [math.GT] 23 Jul 2012

AN OBSTRUCTION TO EMBEDDING RIGHT-ANGLED ARTIN GROUPS IN MAPPING CLASS GROUPS

SANG-HYUN KIM AND THOMAS KOBERDA

Abstract. For every orientable surface of finite negative Euler characteristic, we find a right-angled Artin group of cohomological dimension two which does not embed into the associated mapping class group. For a right-angled Artin group on a graph Γ to embed into the mapping class group of a surface S, we show that the chromatic number of Γ cannot exceed the chromatic number of the clique graph of the curve graph $\mathcal{C}(S)$. Thus, the chromatic number of Γ is a global obstruction to embedding the right-angled Artin group $A(\Gamma)$ into the mapping class group $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$.

July 24, 2012

1. Introduction

Let S be an orientable surface with finite negative Euler characteristic, and let $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ denote the mapping class group of S. Let Γ be a finite simplicial graph with vertex set V and edge set E. The right-angled Artin group $A(\Gamma)$ is defined by its presentation

$$A(\Gamma) = \langle V \mid [u, v] = 1 \text{ whenever } \{u, v\} \in E\rangle.$$

It is known by the work of Crisp and Farb (cf. [4], also [5], [6], [3] and [8]) that each right-angled Artin group embeds into some mapping class group. In this article, we are interested in obstructions to embedding a given right-angled Artin group into a given mapping class group. In particular, we are interested in the following question:

Question 1.1. *Given a right-angled Artin group $A(\Gamma)$, what is the simplest surface S for which there is an embedding*

$$A(\Gamma) \to \mathrm{Mod}(S)?$$

Here, by "simplest surface", we mean one with the smallest absolute value of the Euler characteristic. Given a right-angled Artin group $A(\Gamma)$, there are many restrictions on the simplest surface S for which $A(\Gamma)$ embeds in $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$. Possibly the simplest restriction comes from large abelian subgroups. Indeed, Birman, Lubotzky and McCarthy (see [2]) showed that the rank of the largest abelian subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ is equal to the number of components in the largest multicurve on S and is thus roughly proportional to the Euler characteristic of S. The rank of the largest abelian subgroup of a right-angled Artin group $A(\Gamma)$ is equal to the size of the largest complete subgraph of Γ, which is also equal to the cohomological dimension of $A(\Gamma)$. Thus, if $A(\Gamma)$ embeds in $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ then the cohomological dimension of $A(\Gamma)$ cannot exceed the rank of the largest abelian subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$. If $P = F_1 \times \cdots \times F_k$ is a product of finitely generated, nonabelian free groups, one can formulate similar restrictions on a surface S for which P embeds into $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ as for abelian subgroups. A discussion of such restrictions can be found in [8].

The restrictions on S which arise from abelian subgroups and products of free groups are of the same general flavor, coming from the fact that to accommodate more direct factors, one needs more "disjoint subsurfaces". The purpose of this note is to give new restrictions on S which can

---

The first named author is supported by the Basic Science Research Program (2011-0026138) and the Mid-Career Researcher Program (2011-0027600) through the National Research Foundation funded by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Korea.

be attributed more to the global structure of the graph Γ rather than to local structure (such as the size of the largest complete subgraph of Γ). Our main result is the following:

Theorem 1.2. *Let S be an orientable surface of finite negative Euler characteristic, and let M be a positive integer. Then there is a finite graph $\Gamma_{S,M}$ of girth at least M such that $A(\Gamma_{S,M})$ does not embed as a subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$.*

Recall that the *girth* of a graph is the shortest cycle length. Thus, a graph of girth at least four has no triangles and the associated right-angled Artin group has cohomological dimension two.

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to thank B. Farb and C. Leininger for helpful conversations concerning the chromatic number of the curve graph. The authors wish to thank the Park City Mathematical Institute summer session in geometric group theory for hospitality while this research was completed.

3. THE PROOF OF THEOREM 1.2

Recall that the *curve graph* of a surface S is a graph whose vertices are isotopy classes of essential, nonperipheral, simple closed curves in S. Two vertices are connected by an edge if the two isotopy classes of curves can be disjointly realized. The *curve complex* of S is the associated flag complex of the curve graph. In order to prove Theorem 1.2, we will need the following result, whose proof is elementary:

Theorem 3.1 (Bestvina–Bromberg–Fujiwara, [1], Lemma 4.6)**.** *Let S be an orientable surface of finite negative Euler characteristic. Then the curve graph has a finite chromatic number.*

Throughout, write Γ for a finite simplicial graph and let $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ denote the mapping class group of a surface S as above.

Let Y be a (possibly infinite) simplicial graph. A *clique* of Y is a set of vertices in Y that induces a complete subgraph of Y. We will write Y_k for the *clique graph* of Y, which is defined as follows. The vertex set of Y_k consists of a vertex v_K for every clique K of Y. Two vertices v_K and v_L are adjacent in Y_k if and only if $K \cup L$ is also a clique in Y. For a set F, a map $f : Y^{(0)} \to F$ is called a *coloring* of Y by F if whenever u and v are adjacent vertices, we have that $f(u) \neq f(v)$.

Lemma 3.2. *If Y is a simplicial graph with a finite chromatic number then Y_k has a finite chromatic number.*

Proof. Let $f : Y^{(0)} \to F$ be a coloring of Y by a finite set F. We define $g : Y_k^{(0)} \to 2^F$ by $g(v_K) = f(K)$ for each clique K of Y. We claim that g is a coloring of Y_k by the finite set 2^F. Suppose K and L are distinct cliques in Y such that v_K and v_L are adjacent. There exists $v \in (K \setminus L) \cup (L \setminus K)$. We may assume $v \in K \setminus L$. Since $K \cup L$ induces a clique, the vertex v is adjacent to each vertex in L. In particular, $f(v) \notin f(L)$. We have $f(v) \in g(v_K) = f(K) \neq f(L) = g(v_L)$. □

More precisely, we see that if Y is a simplicial graph with chromatic number N then Lemma 3.2 implies that Y_k has chromatic number at most 2^N. In the sequel, when we say that a graph Λ embeds in a graph Γ, we mean that Λ is an induced subgraph of Γ (in the sense that Λ is the subgraph of Γ induced by some subset of the vertices of Γ).

Lemma 3.3. *Suppose that $A(\Gamma)$ embeds as a subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$. Then Γ embeds as a subgraph of $\mathcal{C}(S)_k$.*

Proof. Choose an embedding $\phi : A(\Gamma) \to \mathrm{Mod}(S)$. For each $v \in V(\Gamma)$, write ψ_v for the image of v under ϕ. By replacing ψ_v by some positive power, we may assume that for each v the mapping class ψ_v is pure. Thus, each ψ_v can be written as a product of commuting Dehn twists about simple closed curves and pseudo-Anosov mapping classes on connected, incompressible subsurfaces of S. Decompose ψ_v in such a way, writing

$$\psi_v = f_1^v \cdots f_{n(v)}^v.$$

Consider the mapping classes $C = \{f_i^v\}$, where v ranges over the vertices of Γ and the subscripts range over the decompositions of the mapping classes $\{\psi_v \mid v \in V(\Gamma)\}$. If a pair $f, g \in C$ generates a cyclic subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$, delete one element of the pair from C. Let X be the commutation graph of C, so that the vertices of X are the elements of C and two vertices are adjacent if the associated mapping classes commute. By definition, Γ embeds as a subgraph of X_k. To prove the lemma, it will suffice to show that X embeds in $\mathcal{C}(S)$.

Write C as a union $\{t_1, \ldots, t_p\}$ of Dehn twists about simple closed curves $\{c_1, \ldots, c_p\}$ and of pseudo-Anosov mapping classes $\{\psi_1, \ldots, \psi_q\}$ supported on subsurfaces $\{S_1, \ldots, S_q\}$. The mapping classes ψ_i and ψ_j correspond to adjacent vertices of X if and only if S_i and S_j are disjoint. For each subsurface S_i on the list, choose an essential, nonperipheral simple closed curve α_i in the interior of S_i with the property that α_i and α_j are disjoint if and only if S_i and S_j are disjoint. This can be done by choosing arbitrary nonperipheral curves β_i in the interior of each S_i, and then applying a sufficiently large power of ψ_i to β_i to get α_i. It follows that the intersection graph of the collection

$$Y = \{c_1, \ldots, c_p, \alpha_1, \ldots, \alpha_q\}$$

is exactly X, where to get the intersection graph we take a vertex for each curve and declare two vertices adjacent if the curves can be realized disjointly. It follows that X embeds as a subgraph of $\mathcal{C}(S)$. ☐

We remark that in the proof above, sufficiently high powers of Dehn twists about elements of Y generate a subgroup of $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$ which is isomorphic to $A(X)$, by the principal result of [8]. The last ingredient for the proof of Theorem 1.2 is the following result of Erdös:

Theorem 3.4. *Let N and M be positive integers. There exists a graph $\Gamma_{N,M}$ of girth at least M and chromatic number at least N.*

Proof. See [7]. ☐

We can now prove Theorem 1.2:

Proof of Theorem 1.2. Suppose that $A(\Gamma) < \mathrm{Mod}(S)$. By Lemma 3.3, we have that Γ embeds as a subgraph of $\mathcal{C}(S)_k$. Combining Theorem 3.1 and Lemma 3.2, we see that $\mathcal{C}(S)_k$ has a finite chromatic number $N(S)$, so that the chromatic number of Γ cannot exceed $N(S)$. By Erdös' Theorem, for every M we can produce a graph of girth at least M whose chromatic number exceeds $N(S)$. The corresponding right-angled Artin group cannot embed in $\mathrm{Mod}(S)$. ☐

REFERENCES

[1] Mladen Bestvina, Kenneth Bromberg and Koji Fujiwara. The asymptotic dimension of mapping class groups is finite. arXiv:1006.1939v2 [math.GR].

[2] Joan S. Birman and Alex Lubotzky and John McCarthy. Abelian and solvable subgroups of the mapping class groups. *Duke Math. J.* 50, no. 4, 1107–1120, 1983.

[3] Matt Clay, Christopher J. Leininger, and Johanna Mangahas. The geometry of right-angled Artin subgroups of mapping class groups. To appear in *Groups Geom. Dyn.*

[4] John Crisp and Benson Farb. The prevalence of surface groups in mapping class groups. Preprint.

[5] John Crisp and Luis Paris. The solution to a conjecture of Tits on the subgroup generated by the squares of the generators of an Artin group. *Invent. Math.* 145, no. 1, 19–36, 2001.

[6] John Crisp and Bert Wiest. Quasi-isometrically embedded subgroups of braid and diffeomorphism groups. *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 359, no. 11, 5485–5503, 2007.

[7] Reinhard Diestel. *Graph Theorey.* Graduate Texts in Mathematics 173, Springer, 2010.

[8] Thomas Koberda. Right-angled Artin groups and a generalized isomorphism problem for finitely generated subgroups of mapping class groups. To appear in *Geom. Funct. Anal.*

Department of Mathematical Sciences, KAIST, 335 Gwahangno, Yuseong-gu, Daejeon 305-701, Republic of Korea
E-mail address: `shkim@kaist.edu`

Department of Mathematics, Harvard Univerity, 1 Oxford St., Cambridge, MA 02138, USA
E-mail address: `koberda@math.harvard.edu`